

ITEM NO.3 Court 5 (Video Conferencing) SECTION II-B

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A  
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Criminal Appeal No(s).135/2010

BUDHADEV KARMASKAR

Appellant(s)

VERSUS

THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(Mr. Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv.(A.C.)Mr.Pijush K. Roy, Adv.  
(A.C.)/Appellant may be shown as Amicus curiaeMob. 9810158653 ONLY  
I.A NO. 80140/2020 APPROPRIATE ORDERS/DIRECTIONS TO BE LISTED )

Date : 10-01-2022 This appeal was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE L. NAGESWARA RAO  
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B.R. GAVAI

For Amicus Curie Mr. Jayant Bhushan, Sr. Adv  
Mr. Pijush K. Roy, Adv  
Ms. Kakali Roy, Adv  
Mr. Abhishek Kaushik, Adv

For Appellant(s) Mr Anand Grover, Sr Adv  
Ms Tripti Tandon, Adv  
Ms Savita Singh, AOR  
Mr Ashok Kumar Singh, Adv  
Jail Petition, AOR  
Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR  
Mr. Ketan Paul, Adv  
Ms. Tushar Bhushan, Adv  
Mr. Amartya Bhushan, Adv  
Ms. Kakali Roy, Adv.  
Ms. Taruna Ardhendumauli Prasad, AOR  
Mr. Parth Awasthi, Adv  
Ms. Deepika Gupta, Adv

For Respondent(s) Mr. R.S. Suri, ASG  
Mr. Mohd. Akhil, Adv.  
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv.  
Mr. Digvijay Dam, Adv.  
Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Tyagi, Adv.  
Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, AOR  
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by  
Charanjit Singh  
Date: 2022.01.11  
17:31:25 IST  
Reason:

Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR  
Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR

Mr Anand Grover, Sr. Adv.  
Ms Tripti Tandon, Adv.  
Ms Savita Singh, AOR  
Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, Adv.

Mr. K.M.Nataraj, ASG  
Mr. Sanjay Kr.Tyagi, Adv  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, Adv  
Ms. Shradha Deshmukh, Adv  
Mr. Merusagar Samantaray, Adv  
Mr. Sharath Nambiar, Adv  
Mr. Raghav Sharma, Adv

Mr. Jayant K.Sud, Asg  
Mohd. Akhil, Adv  
Mr. Sanjay Kr.Tyagi, Adv  
Mr. Sunita Sharma, Adv  
Mr. O.P.Shukla, Adv

Mr. K. M. NATARAJ, ASG  
Mr. Sanjay Jain, ASG  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR  
Mr. Merusagar Samantaray, Adv.  
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Tyagi, Adv.  
Ms. Shraddha Deshmukh, Adv.  
Mr. Sharath Narayan Nambiar, Adv.  
Mr. Raghav Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Jayant K. Sud, ASG  
Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR  
Mohd. Akhil, Adv  
Mr. Sanjay Kr. Tyagi, Adv  
Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv  
Ms. Sakshi Kakkar, Adv  
Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv  
Mr. Digvijay Dam, Adv  
Mr. B.K.Satija, Adv  
Mr. Amit Sharma, Adv  
Ms. Swarupama Chatu, Adv  
Mr. Saurabh Trivedi, AOR  
Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR  
Dr. Joseph Aristotle S., AOR  
M/S. Corporate Law Group, AOR  
Mrs. Anil Katiyar, AOR  
Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR  
Ms. Jaspreet Gogia, AOR  
Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR  
Mr. Anuvrat Sharma, AOR

Mr. Anil K. Jha, AOR  
Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, AOR  
Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR  
Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR  
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR  
Ms. G. Indira, AOR  
Mr. Rohit Kumar Singh, AOR  
Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR  
Mr. S.. Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR  
Ms. A. Subhashini, AOR  
Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR  
Mr. Vijay Pal, Adv  
Mr. Mahendra Kumar, Adv  
Mr. Deepankar, Adv  
Ms. Kajal Kumari, Adv  
Mr. Kundan Lal, Adv

M/S. Plr Chambers And Co., AOR  
Mr. Suhaan Mukerji, Adv  
Mr. Vishal Prasad, Adv  
Mr. Nikhil Parikshith, Adv  
Mr. Abhishek Manchanda, Adv  
Mr. Sayandeep Pahari, Adv.

M/S. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR  
Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR  
Mr. P. V. Dinesh, AOR  
Ms. Kiran Bhardwaj, AOR  
Ms. Aswathi M.k., AOR  
Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR  
Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR  
Ms. Savita Singh, AOR  
Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR  
Ms. Liz Mathew, AOR  
Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR  
Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR  
Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR  
Mr. Garvesh Kabra, AOR  
Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR  
Mr. M. T. George, AOR  
Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR  
Mrs. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR  
Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR  
Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, AOR  
Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR  
Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR  
Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR  
Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR  
Mr. Raj Bahadur Yadav, AOR  
Mr. Shubhranshu Padhi, AOR  
Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR

Mr. Jogy Scaria, AOR  
 Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR  
 Mr. M. Yogesh Kanna, AOR  
 Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Ravi Prakash Mehrotra, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Sachin Patil, AOR  
 Mr. Aravindh S., AOR  
 Mr. Vinod Sharma, AOR  
 Mr. Nirnimesh Dube, AOR  
 Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR  
 Mr. Tanmaya Agarwal, AOR  
 Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, AOR  
 Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR  
 Ms. K. Enatoli Sema, AOR  
 Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR  
 Mr. Satish Pandey, AOR  
 Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR  
 Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR  
 Mr. Shantwanu Singh, Adv  
 Ms. Pragya Singh, Adv  
 Mr. Akshay Singh, Adv  
 Mr. Zoheb Hossain, AOR  
 Ms. Tulika Gupta, Adv

State of Assam

Ms. Diksha Rai, AOR (Standing Counsel)  
 Ms. Palak Mahajan, Adv.  
 Mr. Ankit Agarwal, Adv.  
 Ms. Ragini Pandey, Adv.

State of Punjab

Ms. Jaspreet Gogia, AOR  
 Mr. Karanvir Gogia, Adv.  
 Ms. Mandakini Singh, Adv  
 Ms. Shivangi Singhal, Adv  
 Ms. Varnika Gupta, Adv  
 Ms. Ashima Mandla, Adv

State of Uttarakhand

Mr. Saurabh Trivedi, AOR  
 Mr. Tanmaya Agarwal, Adv.  
 Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatia, AOR  
 Mr. Ashutosh Sharma, Adv

State of T.N.

Mr. Yogesh Kanna, AOR.  
 Mr. Rajarajeswaran Adv.  
 Mr. D. Mahesh Babu, AOR  
 M/S. Corporate Law Group, AOR  
 Dr. Joseph Aristotle S., AoR.  
 Ms. Preeti Singh, Adv.  
 Ms. Nupur Sharma, Adv.  
 Mr. Sanjeev Kumar Mahara, Adv.

**Govt. of Puducherry**

Mr. V. G. Pragasam, AOR  
 Ms. S. Prabhusubramanian, Adv.  
 Ms. Asha Gopalan Nair, AOR  
 Mr. Anuvrat Sharma, AOR  
 Mr. Sunil Fernandes, AOR

**UT of A&N Admn.**

Mr. K.V. Jagdishvaran, Adv.  
 Ms. G. Indira, AOR  
 Ms. Habilila Nana, Adv

**State of W.B.**

Mr. R.S. Suri, ASG  
 Ms. Sunita Sharma, Adv  
 Mr. Vikas Bansal, Adv  
 Mr. Digvijay Dam, Adv  
 Mr. B.K. Satija, Adv  
 Mr. G.S. Makker, Adv

Mr. Ravi Prakash Mehrotra, Sr. Adv  
 Mr. Jogy Scaria, AOR  
 Mr. Suhaan Mukerji, Adv.  
 Ms. Liz Mathew, Adv.  
 Mr. Vishal Prasad, Adv.  
 Mr. Nikhil Parikshith, Adv  
 Mr. Abhishek Manchanda, Adv.  
 Mr. Sayandeep Pahari, Adv.  
 M/s. PLR Chambers And Co., AOR

Mr. Aravindh.S., AOR  
 Mr. C.Rubavathi, Adv

Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv,  
 Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv  
 Ms. Chubalemla Chang, Adv  
 Ms. Jyoti Mendiratta, AOR

Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv  
 Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR

**State of Rajasthan**

Dr. Manish Singhvi, Sr. Adv.  
 Mr. Sandeep Kumar Jha, AOR  
 Mr. Ashok Kumar Singh, AOR  
 Mr. Vikram Jain, Adv.  
 Ms. Pragya Singh, Adv.  
 Mr. Shantwanu Singh, Adv.  
 Mr. Akshay Singh, Adv  
 MR. Arpit Parkash, Adv

**State of Maharashtra**

Mr. Sachin Patil Adv.

Mr. Rahul Chitnis Adv.  
Mr. Geo Joseph Adv.

**State of Telengana**

Mr. S.Udaya Kumar Sagar, AOR  
Ms. Sweena Nair, Adv.

**State of Nagaland**

Mrs. K. Enatoli Sema, Adv.  
Mr. Amit Kumar Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Irshad Ahmad, AOR  
Mr. Anil K. Jha, AOR  
Mr. Rohit Kumar Singh, AOR  
Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, AOR  
Mr. Dharmendra Kumar Sinha, AOR  
Ms. A. Subhashini, AOR

**State of A.P.**

Mr. Anil Shrivastav, AOR (AAG)

**State of Bihar**

Ms. Niranjana Singh, AOR  
Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR  
Mrs. Bihu Sharma, Adv.  
Ms. Pratishtha Vij, Adv.  
Mr. Akshay C. Shrivastava, Adv.

**State of Jharkhand**

Mr. Tapesk Kumar Singh, AAG  
Mr. Kumar Anurag Singh, Additional Standing  
Counsel  
Ms. Tulika Mukherjee, AOR  
Ms. Aastha Shrestha, Adv  
Ms. Purna Singh, Adv.  
Mr. Aditya Kumar, Adv.  
Mr. Abhay Pratap Singh, AOR  
Mr. Radha Shyam Jena, AOR  
Mr. P. V. Dinesh, AOR  
Ms. Kiran Bhardwaj, AOR

**State of Chhatisgarh**

Dr. Rajesh Pandey, Adv.  
Ms. Aswathi M.K., AOR

**State of Karnataka**

Mr. Shubhanshu Padhi, Adv.  
Mr. Ashish Yadav, Adv.  
Mr. Rakshit Jain, Adv  
Mr. Vishal Banshal, Adv

**State of Kerala**

Mr. C. K. Sasi, AOR  
 Mr. Aniruddha P. Mayee, AOR  
 Mr. Abdullah Naseeh, Adv  
 Ms. Meena K.P, Advocate  
 State of Gujarat  
 Ms. Deepanwita Priyanka, AOR  
 Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, Adv.  
 State of Manipur  
 Mr. Pukhrambam Ramesh Kumar, Adv.  
 Mr. Karun Sharma, Adv.  
 Ms. Anupama Ngangom, Adv  
 State of U.P.  
 Ms. Garima Prashad, AOR  
 Mr. Aditya Kumar Dubey, Adv.  
 State of Bihar  
 Mr. Tanmaya Agarwal, AOR  
 Mr. Wrick Chatterjee, Adv  
 Mr. Abhinav Mukerji, AOR  
 Mrs. Bihu Sharma, Adv.  
 Ms. Pratishtha Vij, Adv.  
 Mr. Akshay C. Shrivastava, Adv.  
 Mr. Gopal Singh, AOR  
 Mr. Sahil Raveen, Adv.  
 M/S. Arputham Aruna And Co, AOR  
 Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR  
 Ms. Hemantika Wahi, AOR  
 Mr. Garvesh Kabra, AOR  
 Mr. Chanchal Kumar Ganguli, AOR  
 Ms. Aparna Bhat, AOR  
 Ms. Liz Mathew, AOR  
 Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR  
 State of M.P.  
 Mrs. Swarupama Chaturvedi, AOR  
 Mr. Sunny Choudhary, AOR  
 Ms. Neha Rai, Adv.  
 Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR  
 Mr. M. T. George, AOR  
 Mr. Kuldip Singh, AOR  
 Mr. Joseph Aristotle S., AOR  
 State of Mizoram  
 Mr. Siddhesh Kotwal, Adv.  
 Ms. Ana Upadhyay, Adv.  
 Ms. Astha Sharma, AOR  
 Ms. Manya Hasija, Adv  
 Ms. Pragya Barsaiyan, Adv  
 Mr. Akash Singh, Adv  
 State of H.P.  
 Mr. Vikas Mahajan, AAG

Mr. Vinod Sharma, Adv.  
 Mr. Anil Kumar, Adv.  
 Mr. Aakash Varma, Adv.

State of Sikkim

Mr. Raghvendra Kumar, Standing Counsel  
 Mr. Anand Kumar Dubey, Adv.  
 Mr. Narendra Kumar, AOR  
 Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR  
 Mr. Mahfooz A. Nazki, AOR  
 Mr. Nishant Verma, Adv  
 Mr. Rajiv Kumar Sinha, Adv  
 Mr. Simanta Kumar, Adv

U.T. of J&K

Ms. Shashi Juneja, Adv.  
 Mr. Satish Pandey, AOR

State of Tripura

Mr. Shuvodeep Roy, AOR.  
 Mr. Kabir Shankar Bose, Adv.  
 Mr. Rahul Raj Mishra, Adv.  
 MR. ISHAAN BORTHAKUR, ADV.

State Of Meghalaya

Mr. Avijit Mani Tripathi, AOR,  
 Ms. Tarini K. Nayak, Adv.  
 Mr. Chirag M. Shroff, Adv  
 Ms. Sanjana Nangia, Adv.  
 Ms. Abhilasha Bharti, Adv.  
 Mr. Kynpham V. Kharlyngdoh, Adv.  
 Mr. P.S. Negi, Adv.  
 Mr. T.K. Nayak, Adv.

State of Andhra Pradesh

Mr. Mahfooz A. Nazki, AOR  
 Mr. Polanki Gowtham, Adv  
 Mr. Shaik Mohamad Haneef, Adv  
 Mr. T. Vijaya Bhaskar Reddy, Adv  
 Mr. K.V.Girish Chowdary, Adv  
 Ms. Rajeswari Mukherjee, Adv

State of Uttarakhand

Mr. Jatinder Kumar Bhatiya, AOR  
 Mr. Tanmay Agarwal, Adv

State of Haryana

Dr. Monika Gusain, AOR  
 Mr. Sanjay Kumar Visen, AOR  
 Mr. Bhanwar Jadon, Adv  
 Ms. Adira A Nair, Adv  
 Mr. Sanjeev Prakash Upadhaya, Adv

UT of Chandigarh

Mr. Manpreet S. Doabia, Adv  
 Mrs. Kiran Bhardwaj, AOR



**State of Chattisgarh**

Mr. S.C. Verma, Sr. Adv./Advocate General  
Mr. Sumeer Sodhi, AOR.  
Mr. Anvit Seemansh, Adv.

**State of Maharashtra**

Mr. Sachin Patil, AOR.  
Mr. Rahul Chitnis, Adv.  
Mr. Aaditya A. Pande, Adv.  
Mr. Geo Joseph, Adv.  
Ms. Shwetal Shepal, Adv

**State of Madhya Pradesh**

Mr.Veer Vikrant Singh, Dy. AG  
Mr. Sunny Choudhary (AOR)  
Mr. Alok Pandey, Adv

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following  
O R D E R

On 14.12.2021, this Court directed the State Governments/Union Territories, to issue ration cards/voter identity cards immediately to sex workers on the basis of the list maintained by NACO. The authorities were permitted to take assistance of State AIDS Control Societies, finalizing the list of Sex workers after verifying the information provided to them by Community Based Organisations. The State Governments/Union Territories were directed to submit a Status Report relating to the issuance of ration cards and Voter Cards. In the meanwhile, the State Governments/Union Territories were directed to continue distribution of dry ration to sex workers without insisting on ration cards and any other proof of residence.

Status Reports have been filed by some States. Broadly, a large number of sex workers have ration cards.

The State Governments/Union Territories have informed this Court that the others who do not have rations cards are being given dry ration without insisting on proof of residence. Some States have not filed the Status Report. The counsel appearing for those States, who have not filed the Status Report, submitted on instructions that the issuance of ration cards/voter cards is in process and the directions issued by this Court on 14.12.2021 are being implemented.

The manner of distribution of dry ration without issuance of ration cards is slightly likely different in the States of Delhi and Chandigarh. We are informed by the learned counsel appearing for the State of Delhi, that an SOP has been issued by the Government to the effect that ration will be distributed at 86 centres without insisting on the proof of residence.

In so far as the Chandigarh is concerned, we are informed by the learned counsel, that money was being transferred to the accounts of those sex workers who have been identified by NACO.

The State Governments/Union Territories who have not filed a Status Report pursuant to the order passed by this Court on 14.12.2021 are directed to do so within a period of two weeks from today. In the meanwhile, the State Governments/Union Territories are directed to complete the process of issuance of ration cards/voter cards to the sex workers.

Mr. Anand Grover, learned senior counsel appearing for the applicant, submitted that a large number of sex workers are left out from the lists that are available with NACO. According to the scheme of NACO, a minimum of 1000 sex workers should be there in a community on the basis of which inclusion will be made in the list prepared by NACO. In case, a community is less than 1000 sex workers, the members of such community will not find their names in the list prepared by NACO. He further submitted that in spite of the orders passed by this Court, dry ration is only being provided intermittently by the State governments to sex workers. He also submitted that all sex workers, irrespective of their gender, should be eligible for issuance of ration cards/voter cards as directed by this Court earlier.

Mr. Jayant Bhushan, learned senior counsel/ (A.C) assisted by Mr. Pijush Kanti Roy, stated that providing ration to the sex workers should not be stopped by the State Governments/Union Territories for any reason whatsoever. Referring to the order passed by this Court on 14.12.2021, Mr. Bhushan stated that this Court made it clear that information provided by Community Based Organisations shall be taken into account for preparation of the list of sex workers who would be entitled for issuance of ration cards. With reference to the affidavit filed on behalf of the UIDAI for issuance of Aadhar Cards to the sex workers, learned Amicus Curiae suggested that the reality is that

the sex workers cannot produce proof of residence and therefore, the list prepared by NACO can be considered for issuance of Aadhar Cards by the authority. The learned Amicus Curiae further flagged an issue relating to the large number of sex workers not coming forward in some states for taking ration cards/ voter identity cards which is a matter that requires an inquiry.

Mr. Zoheb Hossain, learned counsel appearing for UIDAI, submitted that Aadhar Card is issued with basic information. On furnishing the name, age, place of residence and mobile number, Aadhar Card is issued. The documents filed along with the affidavit would show that the proof of residence has to be submitted by the applicant for issuance of Aadhar Card. Mr. Hossain submitted that he will take instructions on the suggestion made by the learned Amicus Curiae regarding the issuance of Aadhar card to the sex workers on the basis of the list prepared by NACO, as a proof of residence.

Ms. Archana Pathak Dave, learned counsel appearing for the State of Gujarat, submitted that those sex workers who have not come forward for issuance of ration cards/ voter cards are being provided with dry ration under the existing schemes which are prevalent in the State of Gujarat. As directed by this Court on 14.12.2021, the State of Gujarat shall enquire into this aspect as to why such a large number of sex workers are not coming forward for taking ration cards/voter cards.

The State Governments/Union Territories are directed to complete the process of issuing ration cards/voter cards to all sex workers and report to this Court within a period of two weeks from today.

The basis for identification of sex workers need not be restricted to the list prepared by the NACO. The Community Based Organisations shall submit a list of members which shall be verified by the concerned District Legal Service Authority/State AIDS Control society. On such verification, the list shall be forwarded to the competent authorities in the State Governments/Union Territories for issuance of ration cards/voter cards.

Needless to state, the State authorities are directed to maintain confidentiality as has been stated in the earlier orders passed by this Court.

List on 11.02.2022.

(B.Parvathi)  
Court Master

(RAJ RANI NEGI)  
DY. REGISTRAR